

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO**

SHAWNA ARROYO,

Plaintiff,

v.

Cause No. 17-cv-199

ALLSTATE FIRE AND CASUALTY  
INSURANCE COMPANY,

Defendant.

**NOTICE OF REMOVAL**

COMES NOW, Defendant Allstate Insurance Company, by and through its undersigned attorneys, Simone, Roberts & Weiss, P.A., by Stephen M. Simone, for Allstate in the defense of the extra-contractual claims and [Stiff Keith & Garcia LLC](#), by [Ann L. Keith](#), in the defense of the under-insured motorist claim and hereby files its Notice of Removal and in support thereof states the following:

1. Plaintiff commenced this lawsuit against Allstate by filing her Complaint as Shawna Arroyo v. Allstate Fire and Casualty Insurance Company, Third Judicial District Court, County Dona Ana, State of New Mexico, cause No. D-307-CV-2017-00121.

2. Plaintiff's lawsuit is a civil action which alleges, inter alia, that Allstate committed bad faith and violated the Unfair Claims Practices Act, all arising out of an underinsured motorist claim which in and of itself arose out of an automobile accident which occurred on July 8, 2013, in Las Cruces, New Mexico. Plaintiff seeks compensation for her injuries allegedly due to the under-insured motorist, but also seeks punitive damages, interest, attorneys fees and cost arising out of the claim handling by Defendant Allstate.

3. A true and correct copy of all process, pleadings, and orders served upon Allstate

relating to this matter are attached hereto as Exhibit A as provided by 28 U.S.C. § 1446(a).

4. On or about January 23, 2017, Plaintiff served Allstate with a copy of the Summons and Complaint, through the Department of Insurance. A copy of the letter from the Superintendent of Insurance to Allstate is attached as part of Exhibit A. Aside from the material in Exhibit A, Allstate is not aware of any other process, pleadings, or orders served upon Allstate in this action .

5. Allstate files this Notice of Removal within thirty (30) days of Allstate's receipt of Plaintiff's Complaint and it is therefore timely under 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b).

6. Venue of this removal is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a) because this Court is the United States District Court for the District of New Mexico embracing the place where the state court action is pending.

7. This is a civil action that falls under this Court's original jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. §1332 (diversity of citizenship) and may be removed to this Court based on diversity of citizenship under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1441 and 1446.

8. At the time the Complaint was filed on January 11, 2017, Plaintiff resided and continues to reside in Dona Ana County, State of New Mexico. Plaintiff, thus, is and continues to be a citizen of the State of New Mexico.

9. At the time the Complaint was filed on January 11, 2017, and served on Defendant Allstate on January 23, 2017, Defendant Allstate was and continues to be a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Illinois. Allstate's principal place of business was and continues to be Northbrook, State of Illinois. A corporation is a citizen of the state where it is incorporated and "where it has its principal place of business." 28 U.S.C. § 1332(c)(1). Allstate, thus, was and continues to be a citizen of the State of Illinois.

10. Based on the foregoing, there is diversity of citizenship between Plaintiff and

Defendant pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a).

11. A District Court has original diversity jurisdiction where “the matter in controversy exceeds the sum or value of \$ 75,000, exclusive of interest and costs....” 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a).

12. The Plaintiff’s Complaint alleges damages, but does not allege a specific amount of damages. Where a complaint does not contain dispositive allegations of the amount in controversy, a defendant may determine the jurisdictional amount by the allegations in the underlying complaint. *Id.* at 955; *see also Laughlin v. Kmart Corp.*, 50 F.3d 871, 873 (10th Cir. 1995).

13. A calculation of the amount in controversy includes both compensatory and punitive damages. *Watson v. Blakinship*, 20 F.3d 383, 386 (10th Cir. 1994) (citing *Bell v. Preferred Life Assur. Soc’y*, 320 U.S. 238, 240 (1943)). This calculation may include a reasonable estimate of attorney’s fees, as long as a statute permits recovery of such. *Miera v. Dairyland Ins. Co.*, 143 F.3d 1337, 1340 (10th Cir. 1998) (citing *Missouri State Life Ins. Co. v. Jones*, 290 U.S. 199, 202 (1933)); *see also* 14AA Charles Alan Wright, Arthur R. Miller & Edward H. Cooper, *Federal Practice and Procedure* § 3712 (3d ed. 2009).

14. Plaintiff has expressed in her Complaint that she is entitled to compensatory and punitive damages and interest and costs, in addition to attorney’s fees, pursuant to the Unfair Claims Practices Act and §39-2-1.

15. Based on the foregoing, the matter in controversy exceeds the sum or value of \$75,000, exclusive of interest and costs, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a), and, accordingly, meets this Court’s jurisdictional requirement.

## CONCLUSION

16. This state court action may be removed to this Court by Defendant in accordance with the provisions of 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a) and (b) because (1) this action is a civil action pending within the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the District of New Mexico; (2) this action is between citizens of different states; and (3) the amount in controversy exceeds \$75,000, exclusive of interest and costs.

17. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1446(d), written notice of the removal of this action has been given to Plaintiff's counsel, and a Notice of Filing for Removal has been filed with the Third Judicial District Court, attached hereto as Exhibit B.

WHEREFORE, Defendant Allstate gives notice that this case is removed from the Third Judicial District Court, County of Dona Ana, State of New Mexico, to the United States District Court for the District of New Mexico.

Respectfully submitted,  
SIMONE, ROBERTS & WEISS, P.A.

/s/ Stephen M. Simone  
Stephen M. Simone  
1700 Louisiana Blvd., N.E., Suite 240  
Albuquerque, NM 87110  
Work Phone: (505) 298-9400  
Fax: (505) 298-7070  
Email: [ssimone@srw-law.com](mailto:ssimone@srw-law.com)

and

/s/ Ann L. Keith via email 02-10-2017  
Ann L. Keith  
Stiff Keith & Garcia LLC  
400 Gold Ave SW Ste 1300  
Albuquerque, NM 87102-3274

Work Phone (505) 243-5755

Fax (505) 243-5855

Email [akeith@stiffllaw.com](mailto:akeith@stiffllaw.com)

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on the 10<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2017, a true and correct copy of the foregoing pleading was filed electronically through the CM/ECF system, which caused the following parties or counsel to be served by electronic means, as more fully reflected on the Notice of Electronic Filing:

Mark L. Pickett  
The Pickett Law Firm LLC  
Post Office Box 1239  
Las Cruces, NM 88004  
[mark@picklawllc.com](mailto:mark@picklawllc.com)  
Phone: 575-526-3338  
Facsimile: 575-526-6791

/s/ Stephen M. Simone  
Stephen M. Simone